

COUNTY OF YORK

MEMORANDUM

DATE: December 12, 2006 (HYDC Mtg. 12/20/06)

TO: Historic Yorktown Design Committee

FROM: J. Mark Carter, Assistant County Administrator

SUBJECT: Application No. HYDC-21-06, Davis, Schantz and Pierson, Chischiak Watch

Issue

This application, submitted by Messrs. Davis, Schantz and Pierson, requests authorization to install metal roll-down storm shutters on the water-facing windows and doors of their residences located at 109, 107 and 103 Chischiak Watch, respectively. When not in use, the proposed shutters would disappear into a box-like enclosure mounted above each opening. The applicants propose to paint that enclosure to match the color of the siding on which it would be mounted, thus minimizing the visibility of the shutter system when not in use.

The applicants indicate that wind-driven rain has caused substantial damage to their homes and each major storm event brings the threat of a re-occurrence. While damages have been covered by insurance, the applicants are concerned that unless they take action to better protect their properties, future insurance claims may be denied. The applicants indicate that they would be agreeable to a condition allowing the shutters to be used only during a hurricane.

Chischiak Watch is governed by its own set of architectural controls and an approval process for building modifications. The applicants applied for and received the approval of the Chischiak Watch Association at its November 13, 2006 meeting.

Pertinent Design Guidelines

The subject properties are located in the *Historic Core*, as defined by the Yorktown Historic District and Design Guidelines. The Chischiak Watch project was developed approximately 15 years ago, making the structures neither *Pivotal* nor *Contributing*.

A summary listing of the pertinent sections of the Historic District ordinance (Section 24.1-377) and of the Design Guidelines is provided in the following chart:

Standard	Comments
<p><u>Section 24.1-377. Yorktown Historic District</u> ***</p> <p>(g) Standards and Guidelines for Review</p> <p>In considering any request for a certificate of appropriateness, the following standards, and the Yorktown Design Guidelines, as adopted by the Board of Supervisors, and as may amended from time to time (which are incorporated into this ordinance by reference), shall be considered.</p> <p>(1) Generally, the following should be considered:</p> <p>a. The relationship of the proposed changes to the historic, architectural or cultural significance of the structure and the surrounding district.</p> <p>b. The appropriateness of the change in terms of architectural compatibility with the distinguishing historic and architectural features of the structure and the district. Architectural compatibility shall be judged in terms of a proposed structure's mass, dimensions, materials, color, ornamentation, architectural style, lighting, and other criteria deemed pertinent.</p> <p><u>Design Guidelines</u></p> <p>The Design Guidelines covering alterations / additions to Non-Contributing Structures do not address this type of appurtenance; nor do the standards for "new construction."</p>	<p><i>The proposed action will not change the basic architectural character of the structures.</i></p> <p><i>Staff believes it would be possible to install the shutter system with appropriate color selection, and perhaps a decorative enclosure, in such a way that from the Ballard Street and Water Street vantage points the housing could appear to be a trim detail above each of the window and door openings. However, because the enclosure is approximately 8 inches deep, its projection from the face of the structure will be noticeable.</i></p> <p><i>In the absence of specific design standards, staff recommends that the Committee be guided by the above-noted general design principles set out in Section 24.1-377.</i></p>

Recommendation

The applicants have proposed that the housing for the shutters, which would be mounted above each opening, be painted to match the color of the siding to which it is attached (white, in the case of the Schantz and Pierson residences; Purdie House Gray Slate, in the case of the Davis residence). The intent of this proposal is to make the system as inconspicuous as possible (at least when the shutters are in the retracted position). While staff recommends that the proposed shutter systems be approved for installation, we also

believe that the HYDC should carefully discuss and evaluate whether the housing for the Davis residence should be painted to match the siding or, alternatively, the white trim. Staff's concern with respect to the Davis residence is that the housing might totally obscure the top (horizontal) section of door/window trim. If painted the siding color, that trim piece would "disappear" and give the illusion that there is no separation between the door/window opening and the siding.

Secondly, staff recommends that the HYDC consider whether the metal shutter housing should be enclosed in a wood box constructed either of siding or trim material or perhaps a "hood" similar to the arrangement that is mounted above the front door of the Archer Cottage.. While this type of treatment could help obscure the metal box, it would also add dimension to the housing, perhaps making it even more conspicuous. Again, staff recommends that the Committee discuss and evaluate each of these options. It should also be noted that the system specifications indicate that the enclosure box can be 4-sided, 5-sided, or 6-sided. Staff recommends that the HYDC require use of the 4-sided box, particularly if no additional "trim" enclosure is required.

In summary, staff believes that the storm-shutter system is a reasonable and necessary addition to these structures to prevent future damage by severe weather events. Subject to the Committee discussing and deciding the color and "boxing" issues, staff recommends approval of the request.

jmc

Copy to: John Davis

Attachments

- Application and Project Description
- Vicinity Map
- Photos of properties
- Copies of shutter system literature and specifications and representative photos



Pierson

Schantz

Davis











